HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Butte-Silver Bow Council Chambers
5:30 P.M.

February 4, 2020

Members Present: Steve Hinick, Mitzi Rossillon, Butch Gerbrandt, Russell O’Leary, Jennifer Petersen, Bobbi Stauffer, and John Weitzel

Excused Absence: None

Staff: Mary McCormick, HPO
      Annie Boyd, Secretary

I. Call to Order: The Historic Preservation Commission meeting was called to order at 5:31 p.m.

II. Roll Call: All members present, and a quorum established.

III. Reading/Approval of Minutes: Mr. Hinick motioned to approve the minutes for the December 3, 2019 meeting of the HPC; Ms. Stauffer seconded the motion. The voice vote in favor of the motion was unanimous.

IV. Public Comment – Items on Agenda: None

V. New/Old Business
   A. Annual Election of Officers
      Mr. Hinick asked Ms. McCormick to discuss the terms of the commission members. Ms. McCormick stated terms for each member are listed in the CLG grant application.

      Ms. McCormick noted that the HPC’s bylaws call for election of officers annually. Mr. Hinick moved to keep current officers, himself as Chair and Mitzi Rossillon as Vice Chair; Ms. Stauffer seconded the motion. The voice vote in favor of the motion was unanimous.

   B. Design Review COA: 615 North Excelsior Street
      Ms. McCormick reported that the property owner, Jody Bickford, has been awarded a SARTA grant for a rehabilitation project at the historic four-plex, 615 North Excelsior. The project involves repairs to the four-plex’s brick parapets. Ms. McCormick found the project meets preservation standards. Replacement brick and mortar will be similar to the original brick and mortar. She
Ms. McCormick welcomed Jody Bickford to talk about her project. Ms. Bickford discussed the deterioration of the parapets, which is primarily due to the tar roofing being brought up along the back face of the walls. Bricks at the north corner of the front parapet are becoming more and more unstable.

Mr. Hinick asked if she would be replacing the tar. Ms. Bickford said yes.

Ms. Bickford further described that most of the work would be done on the front parapet. This would involve repair of about the top ten courses of facing brick. About the top three or four courses of facing brick at the side parapets would also be repaired.

Mr. Hinick asked about flashing. Ms. Bickford responded it would be replaced; she is trying to match colors.

Ms. Rossillon asked about concrete mason unit (CMU) walls proposed for construction along the back sides of the parapet walls. Ms. Bickford said yes that was part of the project.

Ms. Bickford asked if anyone knows of where she could get some soft historic brick needed for the project. Ms. Rossillon said that Butte CPR had some available.

Ms. Stauffer moved to approve the project; Mr. Weitzel seconded the motion. The voice vote in favor of the motion was unanimous.

C. Design Review COA: 156 West Granite Street
Ms. McCormick reported SARTA has awarded a grant to assist with a rehabilitation project at the Carpenters Union Hall, 156 West Granite Street. Work will involve replacement of several windows and masonry repairs next to three of those windows. The replacement windows will replicate the original windows in materials and design (wood-sash 1/1 double hungs with transoms), and masonry repairs will use mortar similar in composition, texture, and color to the original mortar. Ms. McCormick recommended project approval. The Design Review COA prepared for the project is attached and made part of the minutes.

Ms. McCormick welcomed Clark Grant, a building trustee, to talk about the project. Mr. Grant said that there wasn’t much additional to say. He brought a wood-sash built for one of the new windows for the HPC to inspect. The windows will be single pane.
Mr. O’Leary moved to approve the project; Mr. Hinick seconded the motion. The voice vote in favor of the motion was unanimous.

D. Design Review COA: 130 West Galena Street
Ms. McCormick reported the new property owners of the historic commercial/residential building at 130 West Galena are seeking a URA grant to assist with replacement of some of the upper story windows. New windows proposed for use are Anderson 100 Series single hungs of the same size and light configuration (1/1) as the original windows. She recommended project approval.

Mr. Hinick moved to approve the project; Mr. Weitzel seconded the motion. The voice vote in favor of the motion was unanimous.

E. Mural Guidelines
Ms. McCormick reviewed the draft historic preservation guidelines for new mural projects that propose use of a local public incentive (URA grant, East Butte RRA grant, and/or SARTA grant). The guidelines are intended to ensure that murals do not adversely impact a historic building or district by considering location, scale and massing, and materials. Artistic composition and quality must also be considered, but Ms. McCormick stated her belief that this should not be the responsibility of the HPC only. She has discussed with the URA board the need for a jury of local artists and others for evaluating artistic qualities of murals.

Ms. McCormick asked the commission for any ideas and/or input on the historic preservation guidelines for murals.

Mr. Weitzel asked about the difference between a sign and a mural. Ms. McCormick said murals are not signs; the difference between them is clarified in the historic preservation guidelines. Mr. Weitzel also asked about historical quotes. McCormick said quotes not used as part of an advertisement would qualify as murals.

Mr. Hinick noted that the guidelines are up for interpretation. He asked about ghost signs. Ms. McCormick said ghost signs are not murals. The Historic Preservation Ordinance provides ghost signs with the same protections as historic buildings. She has avoided addressing preservation guidelines for ghost signs, in part due to the controversy regarding if they should be allowed to be repainted or not. She supports minimal treatment. If the HPC wants preservation guidelines for ghost signs we can start work on that.
Mr. Gerbrandt said they need to look for a jury with trained people to address the artistic values of murals. Ms. McCormick said she would like a couple members of the HPC to be on the jury.

Mr. Hinick talked about protecting the assets that we have.

Mr. Weitzel, a sign maker by trade, said mural projects should use the same paint used for painting signs. It is very important to use high quality enamel paints to ensure longevity.

Ms. Rossillon reiterated the need for the requirement of no murals on primary façades and stated her opinion that anything in plain sight should be a primary façade. Mr. Hinick discussed how over the years each side of a building could become a primary façade.

Ms. McCormick said she was looking to the HPC for assistance in addressing highly visible secondary facades. Ms. Rossillon talked about impact and visibility. It’s her opinion that URA funding of mural projects could be cause for alarm.

Mr. Hinick mentioned that there is a grey area regarding these orphan walls. Ms. McCormick said that painting murals on orphan walls should be required to strictly adhere to the preservation guidelines for scale and massing.

Mr. O’Leary asked about the process to get money: would people still need to go to the HPC? Ms. McCormick said mural projects seeking a URA grant, East Butte RRA grant and/or a SARTA grant will be required to come to the HPC for review.

Ms. Rossillon said she can’t say anything about a mural unless she has seen it.

Mr. Hinick said a good thing is that murals don’t last forever.

Mr. Gerbrandt talked about different situations and why a jury is needed.

Ms. McCormick said she would like the HPC to review mural projects regarding their location, massing and scale, and materials, but not artistic quality. Mr. Hinick agreed that they can’t be judge and jury.

Mr. Weitzel comment on the need for high quality paint. He said that 1-Shot Bulletin enamel paint is what he uses for signs and should be used for murals. Ms. McCormick said she’d add that to the guidelines.

Mr. O’Leary asked if they needed to act tonight? Ms. McCormick said she would like comments tonight so the preservation guidelines can be presented to the
URA at their next meeting. Ms. McCormick wants members of the HPC to attend the next URA meeting to back her on how important the need for a jury will be.

Mr. Gerbrandt noted that they need to address the issues of the ghost signs.

Mr. Hinick moved to approve taking the guidelines to the URA and for requesting the URA to establish a jury; Mr. Weitzel seconded the motion. The voice vote in favor of the motion was unanimous.

F. 2020 – 2021 CLG Grant Application

Mr. Hinick said that applying for CLG grant is something that they do every year.

Ms. McCormick talked about the need to attach minutes of an HPC meeting where the grant application was approved for submittal.

Mr. Hinick made a motion to approve BSB’s 2020-2021 CLG grant application; Mr. O’Leary seconded the motion. The voice vote in favor of the motion was unanimous.

VI. Staff/Member Reports

2019 – 2020 SARTA Grant Cycle

Mr. Gerbrandt provided HPC members a list of all projects approved by the SARTA board for a grant. He noted that the other SARTA board members followed his recommendations regarding applications for funding under the historic preservation criteria.

VII. Announcements

Montana Historic Preservation Grant Application for Fire Suppression and Alarm Systems at the Mother Lode Theatre

Ms. McCormick reported that Butte-Silver Bow is applying for a Montana Historic Preservation Grant (MHPG) for funding to install fire suppression and alarm systems in the Mother Lode Theatre (MLT). The grant is being offered by the Community Development Division of the Montana Department of Commerce. Applications are due February 28th.

The MHPG program requires applicants to evaluate their project in terms of compliance with the Montana Environmental Protection Act (MEPA). BSB has determined that the MTL Fire Suppression and Alarm System Project qualifies as a Categorical Exclusion under MEPA. All work will be confined to the building footprint, and the systems will be designed and installed to preservation standards.

Mr. Hinick advised that pipes in the Mother Lode should be done with historic flavor.
Mr. O’Leary asked if they would be exposed. Ms. McCormick said yes in places but they would be painted.

VIII. Public Comment – Items Not on the Agenda
Bert Abbott and Teresa Doty from the Elks Club addressed the HPC about the Elks’ 128th anniversary and plans for their building

Ms. Doty reported that they hoped to restore the building and the lodge. There is a commercial kitchen on the main floor that the Elks rent out. The grand lodge is on the second floor. Rooms on the third floor have not been used since the 1980s and need to be refurbished. Some cleaning and stabilizing has been done. Several groups use the lodge, but the Elks would like the building to be more fully utilized.

Mr. Abbott informed the HPC that the Elks are hosting an open house for historic tours on February 22, 2020 from 1p.m. to 5p.m.

Ms. Stauffer asked how the roof was on the building? Mr. Abbott said half of the roof was redone about nine years ago, and the other half was redone a year and a half ago.

Mr. Hinick asked what can the HPC do for you? Ms. Doty said nothing now please just come and support.

Mr. Abbott said they will need a new heating system and they have started getting bids. They also want to update the third floor, and that they would reach out to the HPC soon about those projects.

Mr. Hinick thanked them for the invitation to the open house and told them they are an asset in Butte.

IX. Adjournment: The meeting was adjourned at 7:00 p.m.